

Student Name: _____

Debate: Alexander Hamilton vs. Thomas Jefferson - Rating Criteria

The four Major Criteria used in determining your grade in a seminar are as follows:

The Student is...

1. Reading:

- Completes and Uses the several sources - primary and secondary - in class discussion
- Completes and Uses debate essay in class discussion
- Demonstrates knowledge of the presumed opinion of their character
- Relates reading material to the debate topics and the MAIN question - Who is better for the country?

2. Speaking/ Reasoning:

- Demonstrates understanding of the issues raised in the debate
- Cites specific historical evidence to backup opinions/conclusions expressed in the debate
- Makes insightful comments on questions raised in the debate
- Challenges opinions of others with appropriate backup of evidence
- Considers many sources beyond his/her own in expression opinions/conclusions in seminar

3. Listening:

- Pays attention to all students who are contributing to the debate
- Uses other student responses or expands on other student responses
- Records ideas which are significant from other student responses

4. Conduct:

- Attentive to the debate
- Respectful to other students and their opinions/conclusions
- Asks for points of clarification from student, or debate leader
- Speaks to all students and not just teacher or one student
- Avoids speaking too long or repetitiously
- Uses appropriate language

Grade Scale → 100---95---90---85---80---75---70---65---50 /2 = _____

Essay: Alexander Hamilton vs. Thomas Jefferson

8-9 - A Superior Response (90-100)

- Addresses the prompt with a well-developed thesis
- Demonstrated complexity of historical development; works with an accurate and distinctive historical context
- Offers a sustained, effective argument with abundant, appropriate, and accurate specifics to support and illustrate general statements
- Shows superior analysis; displays well-reasoned causes and effect; evaluates historical change and continuity effectively
- Reaches firm, fully supported conclusions (3 to 4 specific points relating to each issue assigned)
- Well-written, clearly organized and balanced presentation

6-7 - An excellent response (80-89)

- Addresses the prompt with a clear thesis
- Shows good sense of historical development; presents a discernible historical context
- Offers a clear argument; uses relevant, accurate specifics presented in a clearly organized manner; may treat some tasks less thoroughly than others
- Provides substantial information; may have minor errors which do not detract from the quality of the essay
- Shows solid analysis; includes historical causation; deals with historical change and continuity
- Reaches plausible conclusions
- Clear organization and writing

5 - An acceptable response (70-79)

- Simple or partially developed thesis
- Shows a limited sense of historical development; many treat some tasks superficially
- Offers a limited argument; may be sketchy and at times tangential; may be mostly descriptive
- Mostly accurate but may have some errors, but few major errors
- Shows limited analysis; presents limited evaluation; supports opinions and conclusions inconsistently
- Acceptable organization and writing

3-4 - A limited response (60-69)

- Limited confused and/poorly developed thesis
- Limited or superficial throughout; shows little analysis; deals with some aspects of the question in a general way or provides a simplistic development
- Shows little sense of historical development
- Offers a confused argument; offers little specific evidence is confined to limited areas
- May have major errors; language and spelling errors hinder understanding
- Weak organization and writing which may interfere with comprehension

1-2 A poor response (59 and below)

- No thesis; may not address the question asked
- Shows inadequate or inaccurate understanding of the question
- Shows little or no sense of historical development
- Offers no argument; may merely mention several names or events
- Provides little information; may have an extremely high error rate
- Offers only generalities; may be largely incomprehensible
- Disorganized; poorly written

Grade _____/2 = _____ + Debate Grade _____ = _____